

November 2, 2015



CITY OF DALLAS
LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on November 2, 2015 with a briefing at 11:07 a.m. in room 5ES and the public hearing at 1:15 p.m. in the Council Chambers of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

* Alternates

Michael Amonett
*Stephen Birch
Mike Birrer
Clint Bowers
*Sam Childers

Mattia Flabiano
Cris Jordan
John Johnson
Joel Maten
Amie Parsons

Katherine Seale, Chair
*Diane Sherman
Kelli Thomas-Drake
Emily Williams

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: None

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: No one

The following Commissioners were absent for the Meeting: **Dustin Gadberry, Ginger Greenberg and Daron Tapscott**

The following Commissioners were absent for the briefing: **Dustin Gadberry, Ginger Greenberg and Daron Tapscott**

The following Position is vacant: District 7

The following Staff was present:

Neva Dean
Mark Doty

Jennifer Anderson
Marsha Prior

Laura Morrison
Trena Law

Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

Briefings:

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

Motion was made to approve C1 through C20 following staff recommendation.

Maker: Maten
Second: Thomas-
Drake
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers,
Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, Maten, Parsons,
*Sherman, Seale, Thomas-Drake, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 3 Gadberry, Greenberg, Tapscott
Vacancies: - 1 12

Motion was made to rearrange the agenda and take D11, 1, 4, 6, 9 and the remaining items in their natural order on the agenda.

Maker: Maten
Second: Flabiano
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers,
Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, Maten, Parsons,
*Sherman, Seale, Thomas-Drake, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 3 Gadberry, Greenberg, Tapscott
Vacancies: - 1 12

CONSENT ITEMS:

1. 1315 Commerce Street

Adolphus Hotel Historic District

CE156-002(MD)

Mark Doty

A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption on 100 percent of land and improvements for a period of ten years.

2. 1314 W Davis

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CE156-001(MD)

Mark Doty A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption on 100 percent of land and improvements for a period of ten years.

3. 8525 GARLAND RD

DeGolyer Estate
CA156-014(MD)
Mark Doty

Enlarge existing brick patio on rear facade. Approve – Approve drawings and specifications dated 10/14/15 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

4. 5907 COLUMBIA AVE

Junius Heights Historic District
CA156-001(MP)
Marsha Prior

Plant two trees and five bushes in front of main structure. Approve landscape plan dated 10/12/2015 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) and is compatible with the historic overlay district.

5. 719 HUNTLEY ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA156-024(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Construct detached one-car garage in rear of main structure and paint using, Brand: Valspar. Main Body: 6002-IC Gray Silt. Trim: 7002-15 Chef White. Approve with conditions – Approve plans and specifications dated 10/12/2015 with the condition that the garage door have electric garage door openers with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 9 for accessory structures and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Construct screened patio attached to rear of main structure. Approve with conditions – Approve plans and specifications with condition that wood is painted to match the trim on main structure, using Brand: Valspar, 7002-15 -Chef White with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 8.3(a), 8.5, and 8.6 for additions and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install swimming pool with spa in rear of main structure. Approve plans dated 10/12/2015 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Reposition fence in rear to access new garage door opening. Approve with conditions - Approve site plan dated 10/12/2015 with the condition that the finished side faces out with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.6(c)(4) for fences and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Repair concrete ribbon driveway and extend ribbon driveway to new garage front entry. Approve with conditions - Approve proposed work with condition that the driveway is brush finished concrete and that the open space between concrete ribbons starts in same location in front yard as illustrated in survey plat dated 10/12/2015 and continues to proposed location of new garage with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.2 for new and replacement driveways and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

6. Install concrete driveway from back entrance of new garage to alley. Approve with conditions - Approve plans dated 10/12/2015 with condition that driveway is brush finished concrete with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.2 for new driveways and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

6. 5326 JUNIUS ST

Junius Heights Historic District

CA156-003(MP)

Marsha Prior

1. Install five trees and nine bushes in front yard. Approve site plan dated 10/12/2015 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.5(b) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install nine bushes along right side of driveway on right side elevation. Approve site plan dated 10/12/2015 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.5(b) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

7. 5519 REIGER AVE

Junius Heights Historic District

CA156-031(MP)

Marsha Prior

1. Replace three vinyl windows on second story and two vinyl windows on first story of south elevation with wood one-over-one windows. Approve specifications dated 10/12/15 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 5.2 and 5.3 for replacement windows and that it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Replace two windows on west elevation, front 50%, second story with vinyl windows of same size and style (one-over-one). Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with conditions - Approve specifications dated 10/12/2015 with condition that replacement windows are wood one-over-one with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 5.2 and 5.3 for replacement windows and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Enlarge small window on west elevation, front 50%, first story and install vinyl one-over-one window. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with conditions - Approve proposed work and specifications dated 10/12/2015 with condition that replacement window is wood one-over-one with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 5.2 and 5.3 for replacement windows, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Create void and install vinyl one-over-one window on west elevation, front 50%. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with conditions - Approve proposed work and specifications dated 10/12/2015 with condition that replacement window is wood one-over-one with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 5.2 and 5.3 for replacement windows, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Replace windows on east elevation, front 50%, with vinyl windows of same size and style as existing. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with conditions - Approve specifications dated 10/12/2015 with condition that replacement windows are wood one-over-one with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 5.2 and 5.3 for replacement windows and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

8. 723 SKILLMAN ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA156-002(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Install swimming pool on left side yard in rear 50%, extending into back yard. Approve site plan dated 10/12/2015 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install concrete pads in back and side yards. Approve site plan dated 10/12/2015 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

9. 5316 WORTH ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA156-032(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Remove siding materials around roofline to expose rafters, repair rafters as needed and paint, using Brand: Sherwin Williams. Trim: SW 7006 "Extra White." Approve with conditions - Approve proposed work and specifications dated 10/12/2015 with the condition that broken rafters will be repaired to historic accuracy with the finding that it is consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.10 for exposing and restoring original historic finish materials and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Extend roof gable at rear of house. Approve plans dated 10/12/2015 with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Remove concrete walkway in front of main structure and install pavers, keeping same footprint. Approve with conditions - Approve survey plat dated 10/12/2015 with condition that walkway consist of brush finished concrete with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.2 for walkways and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Demolish non-historic addition with shed roof attached to rear of original house. Approve with conditions - Approve proposed work with condition that any siding damaged by the removal of the shed be replaced to match existing siding in dimension, profile, material, and color with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

10. 6001 WORTH ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA156-004(MP)
Marsha Prior

Install new brush finish concrete driveway in rear of main structure with removal of three trees and fencing. Approve survey plat dated 10/12/2015 with finding the proposed work meets preservation criteria Section 3.2 for new driveways and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

11. 4711 SYCAMORE ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA156-008(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Install 4" deep bed of crushed granite with 4" cedar border in rear of the main structure. Approve with the condition that the gravel bed is 6" deep. The proposed work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

12. 2712 SWISS AVE

Saint Joseph's Catholic Church
CA156-018(MD)
Mark Doty

Install metal shingle roof. Berridge - 'Shasta White'. Approve specification dated 10/14/15 with the finding the proposed work meets the criteria for roofs in the Preservation criteria Section 6.2(a)(1)(A), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

13. 6119 BRYAN PKWY

Swiss Avenue Historic District
CA156-010(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Install 7' wood fence in side yard of the main structure and paint using Benjamin Moore OC-66 "Snow White." Approve site plan and photograph dated 10-12-15 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-63.119(a) and Section 51P-63.116(2)(B) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

14. 5520 SWISS AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District
CA156-009(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Install landscaping in front and side yard of the main structure. Approve site plans dated 10-12-15 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(2) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

15. 1801 N LAMAR ST

West End Historic District
CA156-012(MD)
Mark Doty

Remove non-historic enclosed cage and install railing on rear facade. Approve drawings dated 10/14/15 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

16. 124 N EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-019(MD)
Mark Doty

Paint main structure. Brand - Benjamin Moore. Body - AF-405. Trim - OC-45. Accent - AF-645. Approve paint specifications dated 10/14/15 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

17. 201 N MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-023(MD)
Mark Doty

Construct rear addition. Approve drawings dated 10/14/15 with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for additions in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(2), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

18.210 S MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-026(MD)
Mark Doty

Construct rear wood deck and pergola. Approve drawings dated 10/14/15 with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for additions in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(2), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

19.303 N MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-022(MD)
Mark Doty

Stain front door. SW 3559. Approve stain specification dated 10/14/15 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

20.410 S WINDOMERE AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-020(MD)
Mark Doty

1. Install windows. Approve specifications dated 10/14/15 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
2. Install new front door style in existing opening. Approve images dated 10/14/15 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
3. Install new side door style in existing opening. Approve images dated 10/14/15 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
4. Install composition shingle roof. Color - Red Brick. Approve shingle specification dated 10/14/15 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
5. Paint trim. Approve color specifications dated 10/14/15 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
6. Install lighting. Approve images dated 10/14/15 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
7. Construct accessible ramp and landing. Approve drawings dated 10/14/15 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
8. Modify existing wood and iron fencing. Approve site plan dated 10/14/15 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
9. Install TrueGrid paving in drive/parking lot. Approve site plan and specification dated 10/14/15 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
10. Install landscaping. Approve site plan and images dated 10/14/15 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

1. 2700 CANTON ST

Adam Hats Building
CA156-013(MD)
Mark Doty

Modify existing wireless antennae size, height, and location.

Speakers: For: Kira Bauman
Against: No one

Motion:

Modify existing wireless antennae size, height, and location. Deny without prejudice – With the finding of fact that the request does not meet preservation criteria. The applicant to reconsider the location and to come back to the Landmark Commission with a sight line study from street level and look at raising antennae height but move back from the parapet.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Jordan
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers,
Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, Maten, Parsons,
*Sherman, Seale, Thomas-Drake, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 3 Gadberry, Greenberg, Tapscott
Vacancies: - 1 12

2. 725 LOWELL ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA156-033(MP)
Marsha Prior

Construct dormer on northwest side elevation, install two windows, and paint using Brand: Behr. Body: PPU11-7 “Clary Sage.” Trim: SC-152 “Red Cedar.” Accent: 862001 “Pure Black.”

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

Construct dormer on northwest side elevation, install two windows, and paint using Brand: Behr. Body: PPU11-7 “Clary Sage.” Trim: SC-152 “Red Cedar.” Accent: 862001 “Pure Black.” Deny without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(i) because the addition is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 8.5 and 8.3(b) that states additions must be compatible with the historical architectural style.

Maker: *Sherman
Second: *Birch
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Maten, Parsons, *Sherman,
Seale, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 5 Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Tapscott,
Thomas-Drake
Vacancies: - 1 12

***Motion was made to rearrange the agenda and take D7, D8 and Reconsideration 1 next on the agenda.**

Maker: Maten
Second: Amonett
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Maten, Parsons, *Sherman,
Seale, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 5 Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Tapscott,
Thomas-Drake
Vacancies: - 1 12

3. 5530 WORTH ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA156-034(MP)
Marsha Prior

Install wood fence on property line within the 50% front side yard and stain, using Brand: Behr #501 "Cedar Naturaltone." Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: Connie Reyes

Motion:

Install wood fence on property line within the 50% front side yard and stain, using Brand: Behr #501 "Cedar Naturaltone." Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Deny without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 3.6(a)(2) that states fences in interior side yards must be located in the rear 50% of the side yard with the finding of fact that the ribbon driveway is a character defining feature and should remain.

Maker: *Birch
Second: *Sherman

Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Maten, Parsons, *Sherman,
Seale, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 5 Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Tapscott,
Thomas-Drake
Vacancies: - 1 12

Motion was made to rearrange the agenda and take Reconsideration Item #1 next on the agenda.

Maker: *Birch

Second: Maten

Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Maten, Parsons, *Sherman,
Seale, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 5 Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Tapscott,
Thomas-Drake
Vacancies: - 1 12

4. 4903 JUNIUS ST

Munger Place Historic District

CA145-427(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

Install four wrought iron pedestrian gates on southeast and northwest sides of main structure.

Speakers: For: Barrett Linburg, William Linburg, Jacqueline Burden, Kandy White,
Against: John Gormley, Beth Bradley, Matt Gobush

*Commissioner Jordan recused herself and did not hear or vote on this matter.

Motion:

Install four wrought iron pedestrian gates on southeast and northwest sides of main structure. Approve with Conditions – Approve specifications dated 6-15-15 with the condition that the two gates along the Junius Street side are inset at least 6 inches inside the entrances and are not flush with the entrances per the images on pages 3 and 4. The proposed work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker: Johnson

Second: Thomas-
Drake

Results: 9/4

Ayes: - 9 Birrer, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Johnson,
Maten, Parsons, Thomas-Drake, Williams
Against: - 4 Amonett, *Birch, Seale, *Sherman

Absent: - 4 Gadberry, Greenberg, Jordan, Tapscott
Vacancies: - 1 12

5. 5010 JUNIUS ST

Munger Place Historic District
CD156-002(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Demolish accessory structure in rear of the main structure using standard "imminent threat to public health/safety."

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

***Commissioner Parsons recused herself and did not hear or vote on this matter**

Motion:

Demolish accessory structure in rear of the main structure using standard "imminent threat to public health/safety." Deny without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(C) because the applicant has not shown that the structure constitutes a documented major and imminent threat to public health and safety with additional finding of fact that the applicant failed to provide proof of imminent threat.

Maker: *Birch
Second: Williams
Results: 11/0

Ayes: - 11 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Maten, *Sherman, Seale,
Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 6 Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Parsons,
Tapscott, Thomas-Drake
Vacancies: - 1 12

6. 615 N CARROLL AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA156-025(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

1. Replace 13 vinyl windows installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness with wood double hung windows.
2. Install door on front of the main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
3. Install 4"x4' porch floor on main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
4. Install 22.5" wood skirting on front of the main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Moez Nagji, Najma Nagji
Against:

***Commissioner Johnson was excused and left the meeting for the day.**

Motion:

1. Replace 13 vinyl windows installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness with wood double hung windows. Approve with conditions that the windows are wood.
2. Install door on front of the main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with conditions that there be at least a 15 light door with frosted glass installed or a Craftsman door approved by staff.
3. Install 4"x4' porch floor on main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness Approve with conditions the tongue and groove 4 inch for the porch.
4. Install 22.5" wood skirting on front of the main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with conditions that wood skirting matches the house.

Maker: *Birch
Second: Flabiano
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Maten, Parsons, *Sherman,
Seale, Thomas-Drake, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Tapscott
Vacancies: - 1 12

7. 4720 GASTON AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA156-006(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson
Construct two car garage in rear of the main structure.

Speakers: For: Virgil Wade Lair, Kristen Lair
Against: No one

Motion #1:

Construct two car garage in rear of the main structure. Approve with conditions - New structure is more appropriate and compatible than existing structure based on the documents submitted by the applicant pre and post demolition dated 11-2-2015 the stair step windows be removed out of stair well and elevation shown be divided light one over one to match existing structure.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Williams
Results: 6/6

Ayes: - 6 *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, Flabiano, Seale, Williams
Against: - 6 Amonett, *Childers, Maten, Jordan, Parsons,
*Sherman
Absent: - 5 Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Tapscott,
Thomas-Drake
Vacancies: - 1 12

***Motion Failed**

Motion #2:

Construct two car garage in rear of the main structure. Deny without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 5A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the historic overlay district. The applicant has not met the burden of proof that the proposed replacement structure is more appropriate or compatible than the existing structure by providing adequate records depicting the original construction of the structure including drawings, pictures, or written descriptions in accordance with City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(2)(C)(i).

Maker: Maten
Second: Amonett
Results: 6/6

Ayes: - 6 *Childers, Amonett, *Birch, Maten, Parsons,
*Sherman
Against: - 6 Bowers, Birrer, Seale, Flabiano, Jordan, Williams
Absent: - 5 Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Tapscott,
Thomas-Drake
Vacancies: - 1 12

*Motion Failed

Motion #3:

Construct two car garage in rear of the main structure. Approve with conditions – New structure is compatible with the existing structure with the conditions that no stair step windows be in stair well and the windows are one-over-one to match existing structure.

Maker: Amonett
Second: *Birrer
Results: 11/1

Ayes: - 11 Amonett, *Childers, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Parsons, Seale, *Sherman,
Williams
Against: - 1 Maten
Absent: - 5 Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Tapscott,
Thomas-Drake
Vacancies: - 1 12

8. 4720 GASTON AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CD156-001(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Demolish accessory structure in rear of the main structure using the standard "replace with a more appropriate/compatible structure." Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Virgil Wade Lair, Kristen Lair
Against: No one

Motion:

Demolish accessory structure in rear of the main structure using the standard "replace with a more appropriate/compatible structure." Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Approve** - Structure proposed is more compatible.

Maker: Williams
Second: *Sherman
Results: 7/5

| | | |
|------------|-----|--|
| Ayes: | - 7 | Birrer, Bowers, Flabiano, Maten, Seale, *Sherman, Williams |
| Against: | - 5 | Amonett, *Birch, *Childers, Jordan, Parsons, |
| Absent: | - 5 | Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Tapscott, Thomas-Drake |
| Vacancies: | - 1 | 12 |

9. 603 MUNGER AVE

West End Historic District
CA156-028(MD)
Mark Doty

1. Install wood, simulated divided light windows on east, west and south facades.
2. Flatten ramped dock and extend to plaza on Munger Street.
3. Install new guardrails.
4. Install new door styles in existing openings.
5. Infill historic freight door openings.
6. Install two iron gates on Record Street vestibule.
7. Install metal ventilation grilles in 2nd story mezzanine level mechanical room windows.
8. Construct garage entry on Record Street facade.
9. Remove metal window on Record Street and modify opening.
10. Modify two window openings on Record Street and install rolling doors and level docking platform.
11. Construct entry vestibule and canopy on plaza facade.
12. Construct one-story rooftop addition on Level 5.
13. Construct one-story rooftop addition on Level 7.
14. Redesign plaza.

Speakers: For: Aaron Bidne, Craig Melde,
Against: No one

***Commissioner Thomas-Drake was excused and the left the meeting for the day.**

Motion:

1. Install wood, simulated divided light windows on east, west and south facades. Approve with conditions – Applicant to resubmit design and specifications of windows to include without limitations window design, mutton profile, glazing specifications, glass samples, color samples, etc. with the understanding that the applicant is submitting the project for Historic Federal Tax Credits to the National Park Service and changes may be requested the National Park Service.
2. Flatten ramped dock and extend to plaza on Munger Street. Approve.
3. Install new guardrails. Approve.
4. Install new door styles in existing openings. Approve.

5. Infill historic freight door openings. Approve.
6. Install two iron gates on Record Street vestibule. Approve.
7. Install metal ventilation grilles in 2nd story mezzanine level mechanical room windows. Approve.
8. Construct garage entry on Record Street facade. Approve.
9. Remove metal window on Record Street and modify opening. Approve.
10. Modify two window openings on Record Street and install rolling doors and level docking platform. Approve.
11. Construct entry vestibule and canopy on plaza facade. Approve.
12. Construct one-story rooftop addition on Level 5. Approve.
13. Construct one-story rooftop addition on Level 7. Approve.
14. Redesign plaza. Approve with conditions - Plaza design is conditional design approval only. Resubmit final documents of design.

Maker: Flabiano

Second: Jordan

Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Jordan, Maten, Parsons, *Sherman, Seale, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 5 Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Tapscott, Thomas-Drake

Vacancies: - 1 12

10. 341 S EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA156-021(MD)

Mark Doty

1. Install dentil moulding on front gable.
2. Construct porch columns and railing.
3. Construct brick planters next to front steps.
4. Install new front door style in existing opening.
5. Paint main structure. Brand - Sherwin Williams. Body - SW 2848 'Roycroft Pewter' or SW 0077 'Classic French Gray'. Trim - SW 2829 'Classical White'. Accent - SW 2839 'Roycroft Copper Red'.
6. Construct 9'-0" wood, board-on-board fence in interior side yard.

Speakers: For: No one

Against: No one

Motion:

1. Install dentil moulding on front gable. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria that state architectural detail must be typical of the style and period of the building. Preservation criteria 51P-87.111(a)(3) and Section 51A-4.501(e)(4)(C) with the finding of fact that the applicant wants to add conjectural features that are not historically accurate.
2. Construct porch columns and railing. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria that state front porch or entry treatment must be typical of the style and period of the building. Preservation criteria 51P-87.111(a)(11)(E) and Section 51A-4.501(e)(4)(C).

3. Construct brick planters next to front steps. Deny without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria that state front porch or entry treatment must be typical of the style and period of the building. Preservation criteria 51P-87.111(a)(11)(E) and Section 51A-4.501(e)(4)(C).
4. Install new front door style in existing opening. Approve door specification dated 2/18/15 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for windows and doors in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(A) and (F), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Paint main structure. Brand - Sherwin Williams. Body - SW 2848 'Roycroft Pewter' or SW 0077 'Classic French Gray'. Trim - SW 2829 'Classical White'. Accent - SW 2839 'Roycroft Copper Red'. Approve - Approve paint specifications dated 10/14/15 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for color in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
6. Construct 9'-0" wood, board-on-board fence in interior side yard. Deny without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria that state interior side yard fences should be located in the rear 50% of the side yard. Preservation criteria 51P-87.111(b)(2)(C)(ii).

Maker: Flabiano
Second: *Sherman
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Maten, Parsons, *Sherman,
Seale, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 5 Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Tapscott,
Thomas-Drake
Vacancies: - 1 12

11. 1904 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd.

Forest Theater

Hold a public hearing to consider initiation of historic designation process for Forest Theater.

Speakers: For: Buddy Apple, George Keaton, Anna Hill, Baranda Fermin, Rayshunda Holt,
Jenneth Johnson, Lincoln Stephens, Yolanda Johnson, Terry Flowers, Marilynn
Mayse, Damon Jamil Tyler, Pastor Marcus Zunigan, Tammy Johnston
Against: No one

Motion:

Approve initiation of historic designation process for Forest Theater.

Maker: *Birch
Second: Thomas-
Drake
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers,
Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, Maten, Parsons,

Against: - 0 *Sherman, Seale, Thomas-Drake, Williams
Absent: - 3 Gadberry, Greenberg, Tapscott
Vacancies: - 1 12

RECONSIDERATION ITEM:

1. 4720 GASTON AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA145-666(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

1. Reconsideration of action taken on October 5, 2015, which was to move to recommend denial of CA145-666(JKA).
2. If Item #1 is approved then consideration of CA request for 4720 Gaston Avenue.

Motion:

Reconsideration of action taken on October 5, 2015, which was to move to recommend denial of CA145-666(JKA).

Maker: *Birch

Second:

Results:

Ayes: -
Against: -
Absent: - 3 Gadberry, Greenberg, Tapscott
Vacancies: - 1 12

***Motion failed for lack of a second.**

OTHER BUSINESS ITEMS:

Approval of Minutes from the October 5, 2015 Meeting.

Maker: Bowers

Second: *Birch

Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Maten, Parsons, *Sherman,
Seale, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 5 Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Tapscott,
Thomas-Drake
Vacancies: - 1 12

Approval of Task Force members for CDBG, Fair Park, Peak's Suburban, South Blvd., State Thomas, Wheatley/Tenth Street, Winnetka Heights and Swiss/Munger Street.

Maker: *Birch
Second: Childers
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, *Birch, Birrer, Bowers, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Maten, Parsons, *Sherman,
Seale, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 5 Gadberry, Greenberg, Johnson, Tapscott,
Thomas-Drake
Vacancies: - 1 12

ADJOURNMENT

Motion was made to adjourn at 6:14 P.M.

Katherine D. Seale

Date