

*January 8, 2018*



CITY OF DALLAS  
LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on January 8, 2018 with a briefing at 10:35 a.m. in room 5ES and the public hearing at 1:11 p.m. in the Council Chambers of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

\* Alternates

\*John Allender  
Michael Amonett  
Diane Bumpas  
Krista De La Harpe

Rosemary Hinojosa  
Mattia Flabiano  
Adam McGill  
Evelyn Montgomery  
Leigh Richter

Katherine Seale, Chair  
\*Diane Sherman  
Courtney Spellicy  
Robert Swann

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: No one

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: **Paul Ridley**

The following Commissioners were absent for the Meeting: **Donald Payton and Emily Williams**

The following Commissioners were absent for the briefing: **Donald Payton and Emily Williams**

The following Position is vacant: District 3, and District 14

The following Staff was present:

Neva Dean  
Mark Doty  
Jennifer Anderson

Marsha Prior  
Liz Casso  
Melissa Parent

Theresa Pham  
Trena Law

Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

**Briefings:**

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

**Motion was made to move Consent Item #8 and Consent Item #14 to the Discussion agenda.**

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Amonett				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**Motion was made to approve Consent Items C1 through C17, C9 through C13, C15 through C29 following staff recommendation and on C2 recognizing that the building is a contributing structure.**

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	McGill				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**Motion was made to rearrange the agenda and take D12, C8, CR1, CR2, D1, D2, D3, D4, D11 and the remaining items in their natural order on the agenda.**

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Amonett				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**CONSENT ITEMS:**

**1. 5733 TREMONT STREET**

Junius Heights Historic District

CE178-001(MD)

Mark Doty

Approval of the Certificate of Eligibility and approval of \$6,695 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Eligibility.

**2. 5307 WORTH STREET**

Junius Heights Historic District

CE178-002(MD)

Mark Doty

Approval of the Certificate of Eligibility provided Landmark Commission determines that the structure is contributing to the historic overlay district.

**3. 6116 REIGER AVE**

J.L. Long Middle School

CA178-152(LC)

Liz Casso

Install new landscaping in existing planting bed at west elevation. – Approve drawings dated 12/13/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.4(b) for landscaping, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

**4. 3015 OAK LAWN AVE**

Melrose Hotel

CA178-150(LC)

Liz Casso

1. Reface fascia of existing metal canopy at west elevation and install flat attached sign on left side. – Approve - drawings dated 12/19/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 8 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

2. Replace 8 canvas awning covers with new awning covers that include signage. – Approve drawings dated 12/19/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 8 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Reface existing double-sided monument sign at east elevation with new sign faces. – Approve drawings dated 12/19/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 8 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Replace 4 flat attached signs on existing fencing with new flat attached signs. – Approve drawings dated 12/19/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 8 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Install flat attached sign on south and west elevations. – Approve with conditions - Approve drawings dated 12/19/17 with the condition that the sign anchors are installed through the mortar joints, not brick, and finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 8 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

#### **5. 1309 MAIN ST**

Republic National Bank (Davis) Building  
CA178-153(LC)  
Liz Casso

Install flat attached sign on south elevation. – Approve - Approve drawing dated 12/13/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 9.2 and 9.3 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

#### **6. 1409 S LAMAR ST**

Sears Complex-Buildings Historic District  
CA178-168(LC)  
Liz Casso

Install projecting sign on northwest elevation. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 18.4 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

#### **7. 1923 N EDGEFIELD AVE**

Struck Residence  
CA178-188(LC)  
Liz Casso

Install landscaping along the north and east side of property. Approve with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

#### **8. 2008 JACKSON ST (Moved to Discussion)**

Harwood Historic District  
CD178-005(LC)  
Liz Casso

Demolish structure using the standard demolition of a non-contributing structure because it is newer than the period of significance.

Speakers: For: Amy Meadows  
Against: No one

#### **Motion:**

Demolish structure using the standard demolition of a non-contributing structure because it is newer than the period of significance. **Approve** - The proposed demolition meets the standards in City Code

Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(D). The structure is noncontributing to the historic overlay district; the structure is newer than the period of historic significance for the historic overlay district; and demolition of the structure will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	11/2				
		Ayes:	-	11	Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	2	Amonett, *Allender
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**9. 1910 PACIFIC AVE**

Harwood Historic District  
CA178-151(LC)  
Liz Casso

1. Install flat attached sign on north elevation. Worked completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 7.1 for signs in Tract A, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
2. Install flat attached sign on south elevation. Worked completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 7.1 for signs in Tract A, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

**10. 5326 JUNIUS ST**

Junius Heights Historic District  
CA178-143(MP)  
Marsha Prior

Construct arbor in rear yard. Approve site plan, photos, and illustration dated 12/20/17 with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

**11. 5733 TREMONT ST**

Junius Heights Historic District  
CA178-145(MP)  
Marsha Prior

1. Install 6' wood fence and stain – Approve with conditions – Approve survey plat and photos dated 12/20/17 with the condition that the finished side faces out with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 3.6(a)(2), 3.6(b)(1), 3.6(c)(1) and 3.6(c)(3), and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install iron gate on left side yard – Approve survey plat and photos dated 12/20/17 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 3.6(a)(2), 3.6(b)(1), 3.6(c)(1), and 3.6(c)(3), and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

3. Install 4' iron fence with gate in rear yard – Approve survey plat and photos dated 12/20/17 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 3.6(b)(1), and 3.6(c)(3), and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

### 12. 5415 VICTOR ST

Junius Heights Historic District

CA178-147(MP)

Marsha Prior

1. Replace 12 windows with wood double hung windows. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve window survey, window plan, and photos dated 12/20/17 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.2 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Replace one gable window with wood single-pane window. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve window survey, window plan, and photos dated 12/20/17 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.2 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Remove two windows in rear. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve window survey, window plan, and photos dated 12/20/17 with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Re-size two windows in rear and install new wood windows. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve window survey, window plan, and photos dated 12/20/17 with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

### 13. 5516 VICTOR ST

Junius Heights Historic District

CD178-006(MP)

Marsha Prior

Demolish accessory structure using the standard 'noncontributing structure because newer than period of significance'. Approve – The proposed demolition meets all of the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(D). The structure is noncontributing to the historic overlay district; the structure is newer than the period of historic significance for the historic overlay district; and demolition of the structure will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.

### 14. 5516 VICTOR ST (Moved to Discussion)

Junius Heights Historic District

CA178-171(MP)

Marsha Prior

1. Construct accessory structure in rear.
2. Install concrete drive in rear.

Speakers: For: Tam Pham

Against: No one

#### Motion:

1. Construct accessory structure in rear – **Approve with conditions** – Approve drawings dated 1/8/18 with the condition that the height does not exceed that of the main structure and that the proposed sliding doors match those in the elevation drawing with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 9.1, 9.2, 9.4, 9.5, 9.8, and 9.9 and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

2. Install concrete drive in rear yard – **Approve with conditions** – Approve site plan dated 12/20/17 with the condition that the drive is brush finish concrete with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.2 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker:	Amonett				
Second:	*Allender				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**15. 819 N MARSALIS AVE**

Lake Cliff Historic District  
CA178-180(JKA)  
Jennifer Anderson

Install Atlas composition shingles in either "Weathered Wood" or "Black Shadow" colors – Approve specifications dated 12-18-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 6.2 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

**16. 4422 JUNIUS ST**

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District  
CA178-178(MLP)  
Melissa Parent

1. Install new landscaping - Approve site plan and specifications dated 12/20/17 with the finding that the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
2. Construct 3'-6" wrought iron fence in front yard and 8'-0" wrought iron fence in rear yard - Approve site plan and specifications dated 12/20/17 with the finding that the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

**17. 614 N PRAIRIE AVE**

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District  
CA178-156(MLP)  
Melissa Parent

Install landscaping in front yard – Approve landscape plan and planting images dated 12/20/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for site and site elements in the preservation criteria Section 2.6, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

**18. 4313 WORTH ST**

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District  
CA178-161(MLP)  
Melissa Parent

1. Modify roofline on existing addition. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness - Approve drawings dated 12/20/17 with the finding the completed work is consistent with the criteria

for roofs in the preservation criteria Section 3.16 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

2. Construct covered outdoor grill patio addition. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve drawings dated 12/20/17 with the finding that the completed work is consistent with the criteria for new construction and additions in the preservation criteria Sections 4.1, 4.3 and 4.4, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

#### **19. 4417 WORTH ST**

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District

CA178-163(MLP)

Melissa Parent

1. Install two wood, one-over-one windows in rear dormer – Approve drawing and image dated 12/20/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
2. Construct wood deck in rear – Approve drawings dated 12/20/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

#### **20. 2534 SOUTH BLVD**

South Blvd/Park Row Historic District

CA178-170(MP)

Marsha Prior

Replace rear door with 6-lite door. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve installed 6-lite wood door with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

#### **21. 5614 SWISS AVE**

Swiss Avenue Historic District

CA178-157(MLP)

Melissa Parent

Paint concrete on front porch floor. Brand: Valspar. Color “Sterling” – Approve specification dated 12/20/17 with the finding that although the proposed work does not comply with Section 51P-63.116(1)(C) that states that "materials, colors, structural and decorative elements...must be typical of the style and period of a main building and compatible with the other buildings on the blockface," it meets the criteria for landmark commission approval of work that does not strictly comply with the preservation criteria under City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(B), because the proposed work is historically accurate, is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria, and it will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.

#### **22. 5902 SWISS AVE**

Swiss Avenue Historic District

CA178-158(MLP)

Melissa Parent

1. Construct porch addition on rear of main structure – Approve drawings dated 12/20/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for additions in the preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(1)(B), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Convert window opening to door opening on 2nd floor at the rear of structure – Approve - Approve drawings dated 12/20/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for windows and doors in the preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(1)(P)(vi)(cc), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

**23. 1103 E 9TH ST**

Tenth Street Historic District

CA178-172(MP)

Marsha Prior

Replace roof shingles. Brand: GAF "Golden Cedar" – Approve roof specifications dated 12/20/17 with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

**24. 805 ELM ST**

West End Historic District

CA178-154(LC)

Liz Casso

Install fastening system for a supergraphic sign on the east elevation. – Approve with condition – Approve drawings dated drawings dated 12/20/17 with the condition that the eye bolts are drilled into the mortar joints, not brick, and with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

**25. 110 S CLINTON AVE**

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA178-178(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

Replace front door – Approve image dated 12-18-17 with the finding that the work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

**26. 333 S EDGEFIELD AVE**

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA178-183(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

Paint main structure. Accent: Sherwin Williams SW2837 "Aurora Brown" – Approve specifications dated 12-18-17 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

**27. 100 N MONTCLAIR AVE**

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA178-185(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

Stain fence. Brand: Thompson Waterseal. Color: "Acorn Brown" – Approve specifications dated 12-18-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(2)(G)(iii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

**28. 303 N WINNETKA AVE**

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA178-187(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

Paint main structure. Body: SW7603 "Poolhouse;" Trim: SW7631 "City Loft;" Accent: SW7075 "Web Gray" – Approve specifications dated 12-18-17 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

**29. 411 S WINNETKA AVE**

Winnetka Heights Historic District  
CA178-182(JKA)  
Jennifer Anderson

Install gate in driveway and stain. Brand: Ready Seal. Color: "Dark Walnut" – Approve – Approve site plan and specifications dated 12-18-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(2)(C)(ii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

**COURTESY REVIEW ITEMS:**

**1. 1409 S LAMAR ST**

Sears Complex-Buildings Historic District  
CR178-004(LC)  
Liz Casso

Courtesy Review - Construct a trash compactor enclosure addition on northeast elevation. Staff is not supportive of the proposed addition because it does not meet preservation criteria Section 11.1, which states that new construction is prohibited in the no-build zone. In addition, the northeast elevation is the front elevation of the structure and a protected façade. Staff recommends the applicant consider locating this trash compactor addition at the southwest (rear) elevation of the structure.

Speakers: For: Norman Alston, Bill Burk  
Against: No one

\*There was no formal motion made on this matter.

**2. 210 S HARWOOD ST**

Harwood Historic District  
CR178-005(LC)  
Liz Casso

Courtesy Review - Construct a seven-story multifamily residential structure. - Approve conceptually with the recommendation that the applicant consider better distinguishing the front main entrance to the structure, and with the condition that final plans, elevations, and details are submitted for final Landmark Commission review.

Speakers: For: Praba Cinclair, Yen Ong  
Against: Lisa Ricci Rafsky

\*Commissioners Allender and Montgomery recused themselves and did not hear this matter.

\*There was no formal motion made on this matter.

**DISCUSSION ITEMS:**

**1. 5726 JUNIUS ST**

Junius Heights Historic District  
CA178-173(MP)  
Marsha Prior

Replace portion of fence and stain, 'Dark Walnut.'

Speakers: For: Ramiro Araiza  
Against: No one

**Motion:**

Replace portion of fence and stain, 'Dark Walnut' – **Deny without prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 3.6(a)(2) that prohibits fences within the front 50% of the side yard.

Maker:	Amonett				
Second:	*Allender				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**2. 6000 JUNIUS ST**

Junius Heights Historic District  
CA178-144(MP)  
Marsha Prior

1. Install landscaping in front and side yards. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Construct retaining wall in front and side corner yards. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
3. Remove tree from side yard. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Andre Savino  
Against: No one

**Motion:**

1. Install landscaping in front and side yards. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** – The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria 3.5(b) that states landscaping must be appropriate.
2. Construct retaining wall in front and side corner yards. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** – The completed work does not meet the standards in

City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria 3.5(b) that states landscaping must be appropriate.

3. Remove tree from side yard. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Approve** completed work with the finding the meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	McGill				
Results:	12/1				
		Ayes:	-	12	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	1	Hinojosa
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

### 3. 5312 TREMONT ST

Junius Heights Historic District  
CA178-148(MP)  
Marsha Prior  
Replace four wood columns on front porch.

Speakers: For: Trevor Ede  
Against: No one

#### **Motion:**

Replace four wood columns on front porch – **Deny without prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it would have an adverse effect on the architectural features of the structure with the finding it is inconsistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation No. 3 that states changes that create a false sense of historical development shall not be undertaken.

Maker:	*Allender				
Second:	*Sherman				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**4. 5318 VICTOR ST**

Junius Heights Historic District  
CA178-146(MP)  
Marsha Prior  
Install side yard fences.

Speakers: For: Ester Harrison  
Against: No one

**Motion:**

Install side yard fences. Approve with the finding of fact that the 50% mark meets the house at a bathroom window and allows 2-3 feet of grace from 50% mark according to dimensions submitted on 1-8-2018.

Maker:	McGill				
Second:	Flabiano				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**5. 4516 JUNIUS ST**

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District  
CA178-162(MLP)  
Melissa Parent

1. Construct porch on rear of main structure. Work initiated without Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Install fence in rear yard and iron gate over driveway. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No one  
Against: No one

\*5:28 P.M. Commissioner Sherman left for the day and did not hear or vote on this matter.

**Motion:**

1. Construct porch on rear of main structure. Work initiated without Certificate of Appropriateness – Deny without prejudice – The partially completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant did not provide adequate information. No site plan was submitted for partially completed work.
2. Install fence in rear yard and iron gate over driveway. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness - Deny without prejudice – The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant did not provide adequate information. No site plan was submitted for completed work.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	McGill				
Results:	12/0				
		Ayes:	-	12	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	3	Payton, Williams, *Sherman
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**6. 4633 SYCAMORE ST**

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District  
CA178-159(MLP)  
Melissa Parent

1. Install new front door. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Install new rear door. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
3. Install SmartSide skirting. Work initiated without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No one  
Against: No one

**Motion:**

1. Install new front door. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Approve** image dated 12-20-17 with the finding that the completed work is consistent with the criteria for fenestration and openings in the preservation criteria Section 3.10, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install new rear door. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness - **Approve** with the finding that the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install SmartSide skirting. Work initiated without Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice**. The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 3.2 that states reconstruction, renovation or repair of the opaque elements of the protected facades must employ materials similar to the original materials in texture, color, pattern, grain and module size as much as practical.

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	*Sherman				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	

	Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
	Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**7. 2723 PARK ROW AVE**

South Blvd/Park Row Historic District  
CA178-175(MP)  
Marsha Prior

1. Install three 5'-0" windows on east side elevation of main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Construct accessory structure using Hardie board. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No one  
Against: No one

**Motion:**

1. Install three 5'-0" windows on east side elevation of main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because single lite, fixed windows are not compatible with the historic overlay district.
2. Construct accessory structure using Hardie board. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because imitation materials are not compatible with the historic overlay district.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	*Sherman				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**8. 2707 HIBERNIA ST**

State Thomas Historic District  
CA178-164(MLP)  
Melissa Parent

Install fiberglass columns to match existing wood columns. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No one  
Against: No one

**Motion:**

Install fiberglass columns to match existing wood columns. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** - The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-225.109(a)(10)(B) that states columns must be constructed of brick, wood or other materials that look typical of the style and period of the main building.

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	*Allender				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**9. 1227 W DAVIS ST**

Winnetka Heights Historic District  
CA178-184(JKA)  
Jennifer Anderson

Install mural on west facade. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No one  
Against: No one

**Motion:**

Install mural on west facade. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without Prejudice** – The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it would have an adverse effect on the architectural features of the structure and the historic overlay district since murals are not typical in the district and it does not reflect historic paint colors or style.

Maker:	*Sherman				
Second:	*Allender				
Results:	10/3				
		Ayes:	-	10	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, De La Harpe, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Swann
		Against:	-	3	Hinojosa, Flabiano, Spellicy
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**10. 310 N EDGEFIELD AVE**

Winnetka Heights Historic District  
CA178-181(JKA)  
Jennifer Anderson

Install 6" Hardiboard skirting and paint. Brand: Behr. Color: 720C-2 "Chocolate Froth."

Speakers: For: No one  
Against: No one

**Motion #1:**

Install 6" Hardiboard skirting and paint. Brand: Behr. Color: 720C-2 "Chocolate Froth" – **Deny without Prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(10)(A) that states only permitted facade materials are brick, wood siding, cut stone, and stucco that must be typical of the style and period of the main building.

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	Amonett				
Results:	0/13				
		Ayes:	-	0	
		Against:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**\*Motion Failed.**

**Motion #2:**

Install 6" Hardiboard skirting and paint. Brand: Behr. Color: 720C-2 "Chocolate Froth." **Approve with the condition that it is one course at bottom of skirting, 6 inches, smooth side out, paint to match body of house.**

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	*Sherman				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**11. 105 S WILLOMET AVE**

Winnetka Heights Historic District  
CA178-186(JKA)  
Jennifer Anderson

1. Replace 80% of wood siding with siding to match existing. Work partially completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Replace all wood windows on main structure. Work partially completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
3. Remove China Berry tree.

Speakers: For: Steve Littlefield  
Against: No one

**Motion:**

1. Replace 80% of wood siding with siding to match existing. Work partially completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Approve with the condition that the existing siding from the rear façade be used on the front façade and that the new siding will match the existing siding with the finding of fact that the applicant has proven that there was significant facade and structural damage to the house.**
2. Replace all wood windows on main structure. Work partially completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Deny without prejudice – The partially completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant did not meet the burden of proof required to justify the work since the window report submitted did not demonstrate that the wood windows on the home were beyond repair.**
3. Remove China Berry tree. **Approve the proposed work with the finding that it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).**

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	*Allender				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**12. 2551 ELM STREET**

Knights of Pythias Building  
Z167-270(LC)

Hearing to consider an application for amendments to the boundary and preservation criteria of Historic Overlay No. 46, Knights of Pythias Building.

Speakers: For: Tommy Mann, Kristin Winters, Gary Skotnicki  
Against: No one

**\*Commissioner Allender recused himself and did not hear or vote on this matter.**

**Motion:**

Approval of a Hearing to consider an application for amendments to the boundary and preservation criteria of Historic Overlay No. 46, Knights of Pythias Building **per documents dated 1-8-2018.**

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Montgomery				
Results:	12/0				
		Ayes:	-	12	Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Williams, Allender,
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

Approval of Minutes from December 4, 2017.

Maker:	McGill				
Second:	Flabiano				
Results:	12/0				
		Ayes:	-	12	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	3	Payton, Williams, *Sherman
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

Approval of the 2016-2017 Annual Report.

Maker:	Amonett				
Second:	Flabiano				
Results:	12/0				
		Ayes:	-	12	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	3	Payton, Williams, *Sherman

		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14
--	--	------------	---	---	-----------

Approval of Task Force member – Leslie Nepveux for State Thomas Historic District.

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	McGill				
Results:	12/0				
		Ayes:	-	12	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	3	Payton, Williams, *Sherman
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 14

**ADJOURNMENT**

Motion was made to adjourn at **5:35 P.M.**

\_\_\_\_\_

Katherine Seale, Chair

\_\_\_\_\_

Date