DATE    December 1, 2016

TO       Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council

SUBJECT  Hire Dallas

On Wednesday, December 7, 2016, the City Council will be briefed on Hire Dallas. The briefing materials are attached for your review.

Please let me know if you have any questions or need additional information.

A.C. Gonzalez
City Manager

c:       Larry Casto, City Attorney
         Craig D. Kinlon, City Auditor
         Rosa A. Rios, City Secretary
         Daniel F. Solis, Administrative Judge
         Ryan S. Evans, First Assistant City Manager
         Eric D. Campbell, Assistant City Manager

         Mark McDaniel, Assistant City Manager
         Jill A. Jordan, P.E., Assistant City Manager
         Joey Zapata, Assistant City Manager
         M. Elizabeth Reich, Chief Financial Officer
         Sana Syed, Public Information Officer
         Elsa Cantu, Assistant to the City Manager – Mayor & Council

“Dallas, the City that Works: Diverse, Vibrant and Progressive”
Hire Dallas Update

• Council briefed on June 1, 2016
• Presented summary of Hire Dallas findings and recommendations
• 5 positions were added to FY 16-17 budget
• Reduced time-to-hire from 125 to 105 calendar days for FY 15-16
Briefing Objectives

• To review current organizational structure with regard to hiring
• To consider the impact of consolidating all hiring functions into one department
• To present recommendations and options for moving forward
Scope

What is in this briefing:

• Focus is on the hiring function of the City
• Does not propose changes to the City’s Civil Service grievance and appeal process
Current Organizational Structure for Hiring
Overview

• Civil Service laws were passed in the City of Dallas in 1930

• Since then, the City has operated with two different departments involved in hiring:
  • Civil Service (CVS)--Responsible for Civilian and Uniform recruitment, application processing, minimum qualifications, employment examinations and hearing procedures. Additional responsibilities include Uniform testing and Reduction-in-Force. The Civil Service Board is responsible for grievance and appeal hearings
  • Human Resources (HR)--Responsible for employee relations and departmental support, classification and compensation, executive recruitment and labor hiring. Additional responsibilities include benefits, training, and meet and confer contract negotiations
Current Organizational Structure

Hiring Accountability

- HR reports to City Manager
- Civil Service Board Secretary reports to Civil Service Board
- Structure results in reduced accountability
- Hiring responsibilities are largely divided between the Civil Service Department and Human Resource Department and sometimes overlap
Current Organizational Structure

**Hiring Process**

**Civil Service**
- Receives requisition from hiring manager
- Posts vacant positions
- Screens applicants
- Develops list of minimally qualified applicants
- Provides list to hiring manager

**Hiring Manager**
- Selects applicants to interview
- Develops interview questions
- Establishes interview panel
- Interviews candidates
- Selects applicant for hire
- Conducts reference checks

**Human Resources**
- Oversees interview process
- Develops offer letter for candidate (pilot departments only)
- Conducts all background checks
- Provides new hire packet and onboarding
- Schedules and administers New Employee Orientation
Current Organizational Structure

**Overlapping Responsibilities**

- Job classification is a system for defining and evaluating the duties, responsibilities, tasks, and authority level of a job.

- Both Human Resources and Civil Service have a role in the Classification system.

- Job titles and compensation plans are developed by HR with minimum job requirements independently developed by Civil Service.
Current Organizational Structure

Issues Summary

Current organizational structure results in:

- Reduced accountability
- Overlapping duties and a complex hiring process
- Confusion among staff and applicants as to who is responsible for various hiring functions
- Delays in hiring
- Poor communication between departments (HR & Civil Service)
Current Organizational Structure

History

- Issues are not new
- Structure has been examined several times over the past twenty years:
  - 2000 “Grading the Cities” report issued by *Governing Magazine*
  - 2004 Joint Civil Service-HR Efficiency task force established
  - 2005 Council briefed on task force recommendations
  - 2014 CPS HR Consulting issued report on hiring practices
  - 2015 Hire Dallas task force established

-See Appendix for detailed background
Conclusion

• Findings from prior reviews
  • Most public entities do not have two separate departments involved in the hiring function
  • Most cities have one Department (HR) providing all of the human resources services

• Each time the conclusion has been the same
  • A hiring system divided between two departments is not the most efficient way to operate
  • Recommendation has been to consolidate hiring functions into one department

• Prior reviews generated discussion but no action was taken

--See Appendix for full copy of CPS HR Consulting survey results and findings
Options for Moving Forward
Options for Moving Forward

Option 1: No change to department structure- Continue to improve hiring time

Option 2: Consolidate all hiring functions in Civil Service
a) Civil Service would be responsible for the entire hiring lifecycle from recruiting to onboarding
b) Civil Service Board would continue to conduct grievance and appeal hearing
c) Secretary to the Civil Service Board would continue to report to Board and coordinate hearing activities
d) HR would retain Executive hires

Option 3: Consolidate all hiring functions in HR
a) HR would be responsible for the entire hiring lifecycle from recruiting to onboarding
b) Civil Service Board would continue to conduct grievance and appeal hearings
c) Secretary to the Civil Service Board would continue to report to Board and coordinate hearing activities

Option 4: Consolidate all Civil Service activities in HR, including Civil Service Board
a) Civil Service Board would become a division of HR
b) Would move the grievance and appeal process into HR
### Options Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Increases CM accountability?</th>
<th>Streamlines hiring process?</th>
<th>Places hiring in one department?</th>
<th>Increases communication on hiring between HR &amp; CVS?</th>
<th>Allows CVS Board to focus on grievances and appeals?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>No Change</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>All Hiring in CVS</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>All Hiring in HR</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Consolidate all CVS into HR</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Recommendation

• Option 3 - Consolidate all hiring functions in HR

• This proposal would not:
  • Eliminate the Civil Service system
  • Eliminate an employee’s rights to Civil Service protection
  • Eliminate hiring by merit and fitness
  • Eliminate the employee grievance process
  • Eliminate the Civil Service Board or the Secretary
How Do We Get There?

• Civil Service Board action
  • Civil Service Board votes on delegating hiring responsibilities to the City Manager
  • City Manager would in-turn delegate hiring responsibilities to HR

• Amend City Charter
  • Next opportunity to amend Charter will be May 2017
How Do We Get There? Cont.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Civil Service Board Action</th>
<th>Amend City Charter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Timeframe</td>
<td>Goal would be to include item on agenda for December or January Board meeting</td>
<td>Goal would be to include any Charter amendments as part of the May 6, 2017 General Election. Ordinance calling election must be approved by Council by February 8, 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What would be amended?</td>
<td>Civil Service Rules</td>
<td>City Charter and Personnel Rules (Ordinance)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What vote would be required?</td>
<td>Majority vote by Civil Service Board. Council approval</td>
<td>Council approval of amendments and Ordinance calling election. Voter approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permanence of changes</td>
<td>Could be undone by future Civil Service Board action</td>
<td>Would require citizen vote to change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy</td>
<td>Civil Service Board would retain authority over hiring</td>
<td>Would provide City Manager with accountability and authority over entire hiring function</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Event</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dec-Jan 2017</td>
<td>CAO/staff identifies all Civil Service Rules, Charter and Personnel Rules which will require amendment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dec-Jan 2017</td>
<td>Civil Service Board briefed on proposed Civil Service Rule changes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feb 8, 2017</td>
<td>City Council briefed on Civil Service Rule changes, corresponding Charter, and Personnel Rule changes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feb 8, 2017</td>
<td>City Council votes on proposed Ordinance to call election</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 6, 2017</td>
<td>Charter changes appear before voters as item under General Election</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summer 2017</td>
<td>Proposed departmental consolidation included in budget planning for FY 17-18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oct 1, 2017</td>
<td>Department officially begins operating under new structure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Today

• Determine Council direction
  • Change or no change to hiring structure?

• If change, determine option
  • Option 2 (Consolidate all hiring functions in CVS)
  • Option 3 (Consolidate all hiring functions in HR)
  • Option 4 (Consolidate all Civil Service activities in HR, including Civil Service Board)
Looking Ahead

• Continue to implement the Hire Dallas Recommendations
  • Civil Service positions expected to be filled early 2017
• Increase support within departments in the hiring process
  • Strengthen recruiting function on departmental side
• Review grievance and appeals process city-wide
• Conduct HR and Civil Service Sunset Review
Questions?
# Appendix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Departmental Hiring Responsibilities</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Civil Service &amp; HR Departmental Responsibilities</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposed Departmental Responsibilities</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Service Categories</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Service in the City of Dallas</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staffing Resource Comparison</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPS HR Consulting Peer Cities Review</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Background

• Organizational structure has been examined many times over the years

• In 2000, *Governing Magazine* published an article titled “Grading the Cities” in which they evaluated 47 municipalities
  
  • Report noted City of Dallas had a “peculiar personnel system, in which two departments—Civil Service and Human Resources—share the overall responsibility for recruitment and hiring”
  
  • “There is no simple logic that explains which applicants are handled by which department”

  • “Applicants seeking City employment have to go through two different hiring departments, sometimes for virtually identical jobs”
In August 2004, a joint Civil Service-HR Efficiency task force was established.

Goals were to:

- Seek employee input regarding two-department system regarding hiring
- Identify and compare City’s organization structure with other comparable cities
- Consider the impact of consolidating the two departments
- Identify pertinent rules and regulations that may require amendment, i.e., City Charter, Code, Personnel Rules, and/or Civil Service Rules
• Recommendations of the task force:
  • Consolidate all hiring functions into HR
  • Retain Civil Service Board to provide an independent employee hearing process for Civilian and Uniformed employees
  • Streamline the appeal process and training employees
• Recommendations supported by the majority of the Uniformed Associations
• Council briefed on February 16, 2005 and September 21, 2005
• Only the last recommendation dealing with the appeal process was implemented
Background Cont.

• In 2014, the City hired CPS HR Consulting to analyze hiring

• CPS noted that the structure was “an impediment to accountability, efficiency, clarity of roles and internal customer service”

• CPS recommended that the City:
  “Assign all tasks and responsibilities for human resources-related activities within the City, including all of the recruitment and selection activities, into one consolidated Department led by one executive-level Director. In this way, true responsibility and accountability can be assigned, clear expectations can be set for a new vision of efficiency and service, and the total staff complement can be aligned to the most appropriate and important tasks”
In November 2015, the City Manager created the Hire Dallas task force to address hiring issues in the City.

Recommendations from the Hire Dallas task force were presented to Council June 1, 2016.

5 positions dedicated to hiring were included in the FY 16-17 budgeting process and approved by Council (4 in CVS and 1 in HR).
Summary of Hiring Responsibilities

Civil Service – Provides candidates who meet requirements of the job
- Develops qualifications for the position
- Posts the positions being filled
- Coordinates position recruitment as requested
- Conducts tests as appropriate for the position
- Evaluates applicant qualifications
- Provides eligible candidate list to department

Hiring Department – Makes decisions on who to hire and when
- Submits requests to fill (requisitions) when ready to hire
- Reviews eligible candidates for interview selection
- Develops interview questions and establishes panel
- Organizes and conducts interviews
- Makes offer and conducts pre-employment screening
Summary of Hiring Responsibilities

Human Resources – Ensures adherence to City’s hiring process and on-boards new employees

◦ Reviews and approves interview questions and panelists for legal and best practices
◦ Reviews and makes recommendations on hiring exceptions (exceptional pay or classification actions)
◦ Processes New Hire On-boarding paperwork
◦ Conducts New Hire Orientation
◦ Responsible for Labor and Executive hiring
## Current Civil Service & Human Resources

### Major Department Responsibilities

#### Civil Service Department
- Employee Civil Service Board, Trial Board and Administrative Law Judge hearings
- Employment Center operations—screening & evaluating applications
- Written exam development for competitive uniformed & civilian job titles
- Assessment center development & administration for Police & Fire promotional ranks
- Physical Abilities Testing for entry-level firefighter applicants
- Reduction-in-force (all layoff & outplacement activities)

#### Human Resources Department
- Departmental Support (Generalists)—Employee Relations—Investigations—FMLA administration
- Employee and retiree benefit programs—Health, Life Insurance—Voluntary Benefits—Contract Administration
- Departmental Payroll (all departments)
- HRIS management
- Performance Management
- Compensation
- Employee development/training
- Executive recruitment & labor hiring
- Employee records—Open records request—EEOC responses—Citywide Personnel records
- New hire physical exam & drug testing
- Unemployment claims
- Criminal background checks for new civilian hires
- Motor vehicle checks for primary drivers
PROPOSED Civil Service & Human Resources
Major Departmental Responsibilities

CIVIL SERVICE DEPARTMENT

Civil Service Board, Trial Board and Administrative Law
Judge hearings

HUMAN RESOURCES

Requisition posting and applicant assessment (results in
development of lists of minimally qualified candidates)

Written exam development for completive uniformed and
civilian job titles

Test development and administration for Police & Fire
promotional ranks

Physical abilities testing for entry-level firefighter
applicants

HUMAN RESOURCES CONT.

Departmental support (Employee relations, investigations,
FMLA administration)

Benefits administration

Payroll

Performance Management

Classification and Compensation

Executive recruitment and labor hire

New hire onboarding

Unemployment/Workman’s Comp

Reduction in Force
# Civil Service Categories in Current System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Non-Civil Service Employees and/or exempt departments</th>
<th>Unclassified</th>
<th>Classified Civil Service Employees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>City Attorney’s Office</td>
<td>All other department Executives (Directors, Assistant Directors and Third-Tier Executives)</td>
<td>All remaining employees (further divided into the “competitive” and “non-competitive” classes, with competitive requiring a written exam and non-competitive requiring defined levels of education, experience or certifications/licenses)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Manager’s Office</td>
<td>City Auditor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayor &amp; Council Office</td>
<td>City Secretary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal Court Judges</td>
<td>Civil Service Board Secretary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WRR Radio</td>
<td>Unskilled Laborers*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library</td>
<td>*Park Board members provide employee hearings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Park and Recreation*</td>
<td>*Laborers are the only “unclassified” employees with hearing rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Laborers are the only “unclassified” employees with hearing rights.*
Civil Service

• What is Civil Service?—A system of protection for employees
• What documents govern Civil Service?
  • The Dallas City Charter (Ch. XVI)
  • The Civil Service Board Rules
• Who is covered by Civil Service?
  • Most departments fall under the Civil Service system
  • About 85% of all current employees are covered under the Civil Service system
Civil Service Cont.

- Who is not covered by Civil Service?
  - Per the Charter, the following departments are not covered under Civil Service system: City Attorney’s Office, City Manager’s Office, Mayor and Council Office, Municipal Court Judges, WRR Radio, Library, Park and Recreation, City Auditor and City Secretary
  - Employees in these departments are exempted from provisions of the Civil Service system
Does the Civil Service system afford any rights to employees?

Yes. The Civil Service system establishes:

- A disciplinary appeal and grievance process
- Seniority for retrieval rights and Reduction-In-Force procedures
- These rights apply to any employee covered by Civil Service
Civil Service Cont.

• What does Civil Service mean for employees?
  • It is a system of protection for employees
    • With regard to hiring and promotions, it means that positions should be filled on the basis of “merit and fitness” (Dallas City Charter Ch. XVI Sec. 13)
    • Employees are protected from discrimination
    • Employees are protected from coercion for partisan political purposes
  • It is important to note that these protections apply to all employees, whether covered by Civil Service or not
## Staffing Resource Comparison

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Total number of employees</th>
<th>Total HR Staff (HR &amp; CVS)</th>
<th>Staff to Employee Ratio</th>
<th>Civilian Time-to-Hire (calendar)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fort Worth</td>
<td>812,958</td>
<td>6,161</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>1:63</td>
<td>100 days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austin</td>
<td>912,791</td>
<td>12,000</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>1:62</td>
<td>unavailable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phoenix</td>
<td>1,537,058</td>
<td>14,000</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>1:90</td>
<td>95 days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Antonio</td>
<td>1,436,697</td>
<td>9,145</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>1:90</td>
<td>60 days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Houston</td>
<td>2,239,558</td>
<td>21,083</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>1:120</td>
<td>115 days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dallas</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,281,047</strong></td>
<td><strong>13,000</strong></td>
<td><strong>89</strong></td>
<td><strong>1:146</strong></td>
<td><strong>125 days</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Dallas has fewer HR staff per employee than comparison cities
- Dallas time to hire is higher than comparison cities
Appendix D: Comparative Cities: Civil Service Roles and Structure

Following the presentation of our draft report findings to the City Manager and his staff, the City of Dallas HR Director asked if CPS HR could provide some options or suggestions that the City might consider to address the constraints of the organizational structure issue we identified in our report. Consequently, we conducted some additional research of the Civil Service roles and structures within a comparable group of cities.

Methodology: Using a website, www.Infoplease.com, which ranks cities by population, CPS HR included five cities of population higher than the City of Dallas and five with populations lower than the City of Dallas. We also restricted our choices to those in Texas and Western cities, eliminating cities on the East Coast for this comparison.

CPS HR did online research to determine if the cities have Civil Service Departments, what the Commission/Board structure is, the roles/responsibilities, and the reporting structure within the City related to support of Civil Service and the provision of human resources services.

The chart below outlines a summary of our findings.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of City</th>
<th>Population as of 7/1/12</th>
<th>Civil Service</th>
<th>Structure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Los Angeles, CA</td>
<td>3,857,799</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Broad Civil Service Rules – General Manager of Human Resources has all personnel responsibilities and attends Commission meetings; Commission has an Executive Director that provides administrative support to the Commission. Human Resources Director is appointed and reports to Mayor’s office.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Houston, TX</td>
<td>2,160,821</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Two Commissions: a Firefighter and Municipal Employee Civil Service (three commissioners) and a Police Civil Service Commission (12 members) – the HR Director acts as the Director and Secretary to both Commissions and is appointed/works for the Mayor. Human Resources provides all human resources services. The Commission administers Civil Service Rules and handles all appeals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name of City</td>
<td>Population as of 7/1/12</td>
<td>Civil Service</td>
<td>Structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phoenix, AZ</td>
<td>1,488,750</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Five-member Civil Service Board – Human Resources Director manages all Human Resources activities for City, reports to the City Manager, and is the Secretary to the Civil Service Board. The Board hears appeals of discipline and appeals on interpretations of Civil Service Rules.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Antonio, TX</td>
<td>1,382,951</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Municipal Civil Service Commission with three members and have added a Firefighters and Police Commission (also of three members) – the Commissions are supported by Human Resources and hear appeals of discipline primarily and/or investigate personnel administration as necessary. The Human Resources Director reports to the Chief Financial Officer who reports to the City Manager and handles all HR activities for the City.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Diego, CA</td>
<td>1,338,348</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Independent Civil Service Commission of five members appointed by Mayor and approved by Council – Personnel Director is appointed by and reports to the Civil Service Commission. Director ensures compliance with Civil Service Rules and runs the Personnel Department for the City, providing all Human Resources services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dallas, TX</td>
<td>1,241,162</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Civil Service Commission appoints and oversees a Civil Service Director – responsibilities include providing recruitment services for 90% of positions, developing and administering examinations, and providing an impartial hearing process. Human Resources Department is a separate Department and has a Human Resources Director appointed by the City Manager. Human Resources handles portions of recruitment and selection and other human resources activities for the City.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name of City</td>
<td>Population as of 7/1/12</td>
<td>Civil Service</td>
<td>Structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Jose, CA</td>
<td>982,765</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Civil Service Commission of five members appointed by Council as advisory body – Civil Service works with Human Resources, but is supported by the City Clerk’s office and City Attorney’s Office. Human resources functions are split between Employees Relations, which handles all labor/bargaining aspects and Human Resources, which handles everything else. Both of those Departments report to the City Manager. Civil Service mostly serves as the body to hear disciplinary appeals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austin, TX</td>
<td>842,592</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Civil Service Commissions: one for municipal employees and one for Police and Fire – Human Resources staff support Civil Service Commissions with two separate staff assigned from mid-management level of the Human Resources Department. The Human Resources Director reports to the Assistant City Manager. The Human Resources Department handles all aspects of human resources services for the City and ensures compliance with Civil Service Rules.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Francisco, CA</td>
<td>825,863</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Five-member Civil Service Commission acting as a policy making, auditing, and appeals Board, as well as carrying out other administrative functions – the Human Resources Department manages all human resources functions and administers the Civil Service Systems and Rules. The Human Resources Director is appointed by the Mayor.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fort Worth, TX</td>
<td>777,992</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Three-member Commission appointed by the City Manager and approved by the City Council Administers Chapter 143 of state regulations pertaining to personnel matters of the Fire and Police Departments – appoints a Director of Civil Service, who acts as Secretary to the Commission and/or Chief Examiner of tests and test appeals. The Human Resources Director manages all human resources activities for the City and also acts as Civil Service Director.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name of City</td>
<td>Population as of 7/1/12</td>
<td>Civil Service</td>
<td>Structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Paso, TX</td>
<td>672,538</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Nine-member Commission: one per District and one from the Mayor – duties of Civil Service include providing recommendations, the adoption of rules, investigations concerning enforcement of rules, and hearing and determining appeals. Human Resources handles human resources activities and provides support to the Civil Service Commission. The Human Resources Director is appointed and reports to the City Manager.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Observations:

- All major cities have Civil Service Commissions and Rules in place. A few cities have separate Civil Service Commissions for police and/or fire (e.g., City of Austin and City of Houston) or just police/fire Civil Service (e.g., City Fort Worth).
- There are variations in the scope of the Civil Service Commission responsibilities, but the most common is to hear appeals of discipline and interpretations of the Civil Service Rules, and make policy recommendations.
- Most cities have one Department providing all of the human resources services and support to the Civil Service Commission and ensuring compliance with Civil Service Rules. The only exception from our research, the City of San Jose, has its labor relations/bargaining functions separately managed from Human Resources; however, both Departments report to the City Manager.
- One agency in our research, the City of San Diego, has an independently organized Civil Service Commission who appoints and oversees the Civil Service Director; however, even in this situation, the Civil Service Director is also the Human Resources Director and manages all human resources functions for the City.